

Goal 1. End Poverty in All its Forms Everywhere

Poverty and Human Rights

Poverty is a major obstacle for the enjoyment of human rights. People who live in poverty are not only deprived from their right to an adequate standard of living, but they are also prone to other human rights deprivations such as lack of access to education or healthcare services. Furthermore, in addition to deprivations of the socio-economic dimension of human rights, poor people are also prone to exclusion from political participation processes or denial of access to justice, making them more vulnerable to be victims of violence, arbitrary law enforcement, torture and other violations of the civil and political dimension of human rights.¹ Therefore, with regard to targets, targets 1.1 to 1.5 are equally important to be achieved by all countries, especially countries that are still struggling with high number of population living in or below the poverty line.

Despite of the economic growth in the past two decades that has put Indonesia among lower middle income countries, Indonesia is still facing a wide gap of inequality and poverty. According to the UNPDF, Indonesia is still struggling with the following challenges with regard to poverty:

- There are still 103 million Indonesians or 43.5 percent of the population live on less than USD 2 a day and remain extremely vulnerable to any economic or environmental disasters;
- 28 million Indonesian are living below the national poverty line of living on under IDR. 333.034 per month,² which is roughly less than 86¢ per day;
- Income disparities are rising, with the Gini Index rose from 0.32 in 1999 to 0.41 in 2011;
- The current social protection schemes are not very effective in the effort to alleviate poverty;

With almost half of the population living in vulnerable economy, it is important for Indonesia to eradicate poverty as both of its development and human rights agendas to ensure the fulfillment of the right to an adequate standard of living for all Indonesians.

The National Targets on Poverty

Four out of the seven existing global targets on ending poverty are considered by the Government of Indonesia (GoI) to be in line with its National Mid-term Development Plan (RPJMN) of 2015-2019. The corresponding targets have been incorporated in the GoI's National Implementation Plan of SDGs.

Table I.a. List of global and national SDGs targets.

Global Target	National Target	National Indicator
1.1. By 2030, eradicate extreme poverty for all people everywhere, currently measured as people living on less than \$1.25 a day.	1. Decreased poverty level.	N/A

¹ <http://www.ohchr.org/EN/Issues/Poverty/Pages/SRExtremePovertyIndex.aspx>

² Badan Pusat Statistik, Garis Kemiskinan Menurut Provinsi, 2013 - 2015, available at: <https://www.bps.go.id/linkTableDinamis/view/id/1120>.

*Analytical Framework for
Linking Sustainable Development Goals with Human Rights Obligations in Indonesia*

Global Target	National Target	National Indicator
1.2. By 2030, reduce at least by half the proportion of men, women and children of all ages living in poverty in all its dimensions according to national definitions.	1. Decreased poverty level.	a. Decreased poverty level, from 9.5-10% in 2015, to 7-8% by 2019.
1.3. Implement nationally appropriate social protection systems and measures for all, including floors, and by 2030 achieve substantial coverage of the poor and the vulnerable.	<p>1. Increased social protection, productivity and the fulfillment of basic rights for the poor;</p> <p>2. Increased access for poor and vulnerable families, including children, people with disabilities, and elderly people, as well as marginalized groups, to fulfill their basic needs;</p> <p>3. Increased number of membership in the National Security System Programs.</p>	<p>a. Increased enrollment percentage of the National Health Insurance program (Kartu Indonesia Sehat), from 60% in 2015, to 95% in 2019.</p> <p>b. Increased percentage of poor and vulnerable elderly people to receive basic necessity assistances, from 2.24% in 2015, to 2.28% in 2019.</p> <p>c. Increased percentage of poor and vulnerable disabled people to receive basic necessity assistances, from 14.48% in 2015, to 17.12% in 2019.</p> <p>d. Decreased number of poor households to receive conditional cash transfer, from three million households in 2015, to 2.8 million households in 2019.</p> <p>e. Increased enrollment number of the National Social Security System (SJSN) for Employment, from 29.5 million of formal employees and 1.3 million of informal employees in 2015, to 62.4 million and 3.5 million in 2019.</p>
1.4. By 2030, ensure that all men and women, in particular the poor and the vulnerable, have equal rights to economic resources, as well as access to basic services, ownership and control over land and other forms of property, inheritance, natural resources, appropriate new technology and financial services, including microfinance.	1. Increased coverage of basic services, covering legal identity, health education facilities and infrastructures, basic infrastructures and inclusive economic facilities for the poor, including people with disabilities and elderly people.	<p>a. Increased coverage of maternal delivery care in health facilities, from 75% in 2015, to 85% in 2019;</p> <p>b. Increased coverage of basic immunization for children between the age of 12-23 months to 63% in 2019;</p> <p>c. Increased coverage of contraception use for women between the age of 15-49 years, from 61.9% in 2015, to 66% in 2019;</p> <p>d. Increased access to safe drinking water, from 60.9% in 2015, to 100% in 2019;</p> <p>e. Increased access to an adequate sanitation, from 60.9% in 2015, to 100% in 2019;</p> <p>f. Increased number of low-income households to access adequate housing to 18.6 households in 2019.</p>

*Analytical Framework for
Linking Sustainable Development Goals with Human Rights Obligations in Indonesia*

Global Target	National Target	National Indicator
1.5. By 2030, build the resilience of the poor and those in vulnerable situations and reduce their exposure and vulnerability to climate-related extreme events and other economic, social and environmental shocks and disasters.	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Disaster risks/reduction management; 2. Provision of basic needs assistance for social disaster victims; 3. Increased access and quality of special education and special service education for primary and secondary education for children with special needs (SDLB/SMPLB); 4. Provision of special houses in post disaster/conflict, maritime and border areas; 5. Availability of national and local strategies for disaster risk reduction. 	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> a. Increased the location number of strengthened disaster risk reduction areas, from 35 areas in 2015, to 39 areas in 2019. b. Increased number of social disaster victims to receive basic necessities assistance, from 43 thousand victims in 2015, to 151 thousand victims in 2019; c. Increased number of social disaster victims to receive psychosocial treatments, from 21.5 thousand victims in 2015, to 81.5 thousand victims in 2019; d. Increased number of natural/social disaster affected areas to receive special services education, from 100 in 2015, to 450 in 2019.
1.a. Ensure significant mobilization of resources from a variety of sources, including through enhanced development cooperation, in order to provide adequate and predictable means for developing countries, in particular least developed countries, to implement programs and policies to end poverty in all its dimensions.	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Increased direct allocation from the government to poverty alleviation programs; 2. Increased expenditures for primary services (education, healthcare and social protection) 	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> a. Budget allocations for poverty alleviation programs in various sectors. b. Annual percentage of budget allocation for education from the state budget (APBN); c. Annual percentage of budget allocation for social protection from the state budget (APBN);
1. b. Create sound policy frameworks at the national, regional and international levels, based on pro-poor and gender-sensitive development strategies, to support accelerated investment in poverty eradication actions	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Policy framework for poverty alleviation, climate change, sustainable development, food and nutritions. 	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> a. National Action Plan for Poverty Alleviation; b. National Action Plan for Greenhouse Gas; c. National Action Plan for SDGs; d. National Action Plan for Food and Nutritions; e. Implementation of the Minister of Finance Decree on gender responsive planning and budgeting.

Gap Analysis

Definition of the Poor.

To combat poverty and to fulfill the right of the people to obtain an adequate standard of living is not only a developmental programmatic aspiration but, most importantly, a human right obligation of every State towards its citizens, especially for the State parties to the International Covenant of Economic, Social and Cultural Rights (ICESCR), such as Indonesia. In addition to the obligations set forth under Article 11 of the ICESCR to respect, protect and fulfill the right to an adequate standard of living for the persons and their families, Gol is also bound by the 1945 Constitution, particularly Article 28C paragraph (1), stating that “*Every person shall have the right to develop him/herself through the fulfillment of his/her basic needs...*”.

From a human rights perspective, poverty represents the lack of ability of a person to fulfill her basic capabilities.³ Therefore, it is important to measure the minimum requirement for people to acquire their basic needs as a condition to define poverty line at the national level.

The Indonesian Statistic Agency (BPS) provides measurements on both the National poverty threshold (GK) and the minimum cost of living. However, there is still a wide gap between the two measurements. While the National minimum cost of living is set at IDR. 1.123.744/month (\pm USD 2.9/day)⁴, the poverty threshold is set at IDR. 333.034/month (\pm USD 0.85/day).⁵ That being said, for those who live on the National poverty line are principally living in extreme poverty, as they are almost three times below the National standard to acquire their basic capabilities. Moreover, those who live on less than USD 2/day are also living in extreme deprivation of adequate achievement of those basic capabilities.

To this end, in order for the Gol to create an impactful outcome in its effort to eradicate poverty in Indonesia, it should use the minimum cost of living as a measurement to define poverty line and identify poor population in the national development target.

Social Protection System

Social protection plays an important role in poverty reduction measure as it allowing the beneficiaries, which are mostly people living in poverty, to generate income and enjoy their basic human rights to an adequate standard of living. The ICESCR provides for the right to social protection/social security as a human right in Article 9, stating that “*The States Parties to the present Covenant recognize the right of everyone to social security, including social insurance.*” Moreover, the guarantee of social protection is also enshrined in the 1945 constitution, Article 28H paragraph (3) providing that “*Every person shall have the right to social security in order to develop oneself fully as a dignified human being.*” as well as Article 34 paragraph (2), providing that “*The state shall develop a system of social security for all of the people and shall empower the inadequate and underprivileged in society in accordance with human dignity.*”

The right to social security/social protection is defined by the Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights (CESCR) as “the right to access and maintain benefits, whether in cash or in kind, without discrimination in order to secure protection, inter alia, from (a) lack of work-related income caused by sickness, disability, maternity, employment injury, unemployment, old age, or death of a

³ OHCHR, PRINCIPLES AND GUIDELINES FOR A HUMAN RIGHTS APPROACH TO POVERTY REDUCTION STRATEGIES, paragraph: 30, available at: <http://www.ohchr.org/Documents/Publications/PovertyStrategiesen.pdf>

⁴ BPS, Kebutuhan Hidup Minimum/Layak (Khm/Khl) Selama Sebulan (Rupiah) Menurut Provinsi 2005-2015, available at: <https://www.bps.go.id/linkTableDinamis/view/id/1212>

⁵ BPS, Garis Kemiskinan Menurut Provinsi, 2013 - 2015, available at: <https://www.bps.go.id/linkTableDinamis/view/id/1120>

family member; (b) unaffordable access to health care; (c) insufficient family support, particularly for children and adult dependents.”

Indonesia runs its social security system through various ministries and agencies, such as the National Health Insurance Agency (BPJS Kesehatan) and the National Social Security Agency for Employment (BPJS Ketenagakerjaan), the Ministry of Social Affairs, the Ministry of Religious Affairs and many others. The unavailability of a single window service in managing the social protection system has created issues of coordination and overlapping programs. According to Bappenas, in addition to lack of coordination, the social protection system is also facing other challenges such as not reaching the intended target group appropriately, insufficient budget and lack of optimal programmatic accompaniment mechanism.⁶ The UNPDF also identifies that the current social protection schemes are narrowly targeted, conditional, low value, very expensive to administer, and have no positive impact on reducing poverty or child poverty rates.⁷ The value of some cash transfer programs, for instance the Program Keluarga Harapan (PKH), a conditional cash transfer program for very poor families, it only provides cash assistance of maximum IDR. 3.700.000 annually,⁸ less than 30% of the national minimum cost of living.

Moreover, while there are currently 7.2 million of unemployed persons, Indonesia does not have an employment benefit scheme to secure a basic income for unemployed persons to enable them to provide their basic needs. This issue has been raised by the CESR in its concluding observations on the Gol initial report on Implementation of the International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights in Indonesia. To this end, the CESR recommended the Gol to “Pursue its efforts towards the establishment of an unemployment insurance scheme.”⁹ ,

In order to strengthen the social protection system to effectively play its role in alleviating poverty in Indonesia, as well as for the Gol to respect, protect and fulfill its human rights obligations towards providing an adequate social protection system, the Gol should, at least, consider the following measures:

- adopt and implement a single window services for social protection programs to facilitate people to access a comprehensive social protection system, as well as to improve coordination and prevent overlaps among programs;
- increase the amount of basic income security to correspond to the value of nationally defined minimum cost of living, in order to prevent vulnerable people from extreme deprivation of their basic needs;
- Adopt policies and implement programs to provide unemployment benefit to prevent unemployed persons from extreme deprivation of their basic needs.

Access to Basic Services and Land Ownership

Access to basic services, such as electricity, proper sanitation, clean and drinkable water, adequate health and education facilities are fundamental for every household to be able to function well. Access to these basic services are related to various human rights guarantees enshrined in the ICESCR, particularly with regard to the right to an adequate standard of living (Article 11), the right to the enjoyment of the highest attainable standard of physical and mental health (Article 12), and

⁶ Bappenas, PERLINDUNGAN SOSIAL DI INDONESIA: TANTANGAN DAN ARAH KE DEPAN, 2014, page: 33-37, available at: http://www.bappenas.go.id/index.php/download_file/view/16956/8605/

⁷ UNPDF, page:17.

⁸ TNP2K: <http://www.tnp2k.go.id/id/tanya-jawab/klaster-i/program-jaminan-kesehatan-nasional-jkn/>

⁹ Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights, Concluding Observations on the initial report of Indonesia, E/C.12/IDN/CO/1, 2014, paragraph: 21 (c). Available at: http://tbinternet.ohchr.org/_layouts/TreatyBodyExternal/Countries.aspx?CountryCode=IDN&Lang=EN.

the right to education (Article 13). The right to basic services are also enshrined in the 1945 Constitution of the Republic Indonesia, particularly in Article 28H paragraph (1) “Every person shall have the right to live in physical and spiritual prosperity, to have a home and to enjoy a good and healthy environment, and shall have the right to obtain medical care.” as well as all the constitutional guarantees regarding the right to education provided for in Article 31.

As of 2015, the majority of households in Indonesia (97.5%) have access to electricity in their homes, however, there are still 39% of households are without access to adequate source of water and 38% of households are without access to adequate sanitation,¹⁰ contributing to 22% of the population practicing open defecation.¹¹ Furthermore, there are only 34,857 public community health centers (Puskesmas)/supporting health centers (Pustu) serving 81.626 sub-district/villages across Indonesia, which means that there are still 57% of sub-districts/villages without access to the most moderate health facility.

As for land tenure, despite the fact that 83% of households own their own home, there are still 40% of uncertified lands in Indonesia due to the complicated land adjudication process¹² and 69% of the land is owned by approximately 16% of the population.¹³ Moreover, limited information on zoning plans and regulations have also created difficulties in registration process and increasing the risks of evictions.¹⁴ Therefore, security of land tenure is also a very important factor, especially for the poor, since land does not only provide shelter, but also a source of livelihood for them.

To this end, there are several components with regard to land ownership and access to basic services to correspond with the goal to end poverty in all its forms in Indonesia:

- Adopt and implement Land policy with the aim to protect the interests of low-income households and vulnerable groups;
- Reform existing regulations on land title and registration to simplify the process, reduce the costs to individuals, increase efficiency and diminish delays;
- Improve the coverage and quality of health facilities to provide better healthcare access in every sub-district/village;
- Increase the number of households with access to adequate sanitation.

Vulnerable Groups

Women/children, people with disabilities, and indigenous peoples are vulnerable to a severer conditions of poverty. Recent studies indicate that people with disabilities in Indonesia are 30 to 50 per cent more likely to be poor and without employment than those without disabilities.¹⁵ Therefore, in terms of social protection provision, it is important to secure basic income for poor unemployed people with disability to fully enable them to fulfill their basic needs. The current scheme to support basic income for people with disability deemed insufficient, as it only covers less than 30% of the monthly minimum living cost set nationally.

Basic services must also be arranged in a way that people with disability can access them just like other people without disability and in accordance with the right of people with disability to an adequate standard of living and social protection provided for in Article 28 of the Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities, to which Indonesia is a party. Moreover, the Program Keluarga

¹⁰ BPS, Indikator Perumahan 1993-2015: <https://www.bps.go.id/linkTabelStatis/view/id/1537>

¹¹ See, UNPDF: page 22.

¹² Minister of Agrarian and Spatial Planning, Sofyan Djilil: <http://finance.detik.com/properti/d-3284575/menteri-atr-baru-60-tanah-di-indonesia-yang-bersertifikat>

¹³ See, UN Special Rapporteur on Adequate Housing, paragraph 42.

¹⁴ See, UN Special Rapporteur on Adequate Housing, paragraph 46.

¹⁵ UNPDF, page: 16-17.

Harapan (PKH), a conditional cash transfer program, may deprive poor women living in remote areas without access to health facilities due to its strict conditions requiring women to conduct a rigid number of medical examination during and after pregnancy.

With regard to land ownership, although joint ownership for property purchased during marriage is recognized by the law, however the number of joint registered of land are still very low. In Java, In Java, for instance, there are only 5% of registered land in the names of husband and wife, while 65% of new titles are issued in the names of men and 30% in the names of women, due to lack of information and awareness of both the public and registration officers about the option of joint registration.¹⁶ Therefore, information with regard to the option of joint registration must be thoroughly disseminated and training among land registration officers about the issue should also be conducted regularly in order to strengthen land ownership for women.

Indigenous peoples are among vulnerable groups facing tenure insecurity. Despite the legal recognition of customary land (*tanah ulayat*), collective ownership of land cannot be registered, deterring indigenous communities from applying collectively for land certificates. As a result, 33,000 indigenous villages, with approximate population of 48 million people, located within or around forest estates, are labeled as illegal or squatters and prone to forced eviction.¹⁷ Therefore, it is important for the Gol to ensure that land policy are also directed towards the protection of land security of indigenous communities occupying land based on customary law.

Human Rights Based Approach for the National Targets on Goal I.

In light of the above gap analyses, we suggest the following additional indicators to strengthen the impacts of poverty alleviation as well as the human rights respect, protection and fulfillment at the national level.

Table I.b. HRBA Indicators.

National Target	National Indicators	Suggested HRBA Indicators
1.2. Poverty level.	a. Decreased poverty level, from 9.5-10% in 2015, to 7-8% by 2019.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - The availability of an adequate definition of the poor, referring to those who live on less than the latest national minimum cost of living in every regulations and/or other policies on poverty alleviation interventions. - Proportion of people living below national benchmark of minimum basic cost of living (angka kebutuhan hidup minimum/bulan).

¹⁶ See, UN Special Rapporteur on Adequate Housing, paragraph 66.

¹⁷ See, UN Special Rapporteur on Adequate Housing, paragraph 48-49.

*Analytical Framework for
Linking Sustainable Development Goals with Human Rights Obligations in Indonesia*

National Target	National Indicators	Suggested HRBA Indicators
1.3 Access to social protection.	<p>a. Increased enrollment percentage of the National Health Insurance program (Kartu Indonesia Sehat), from 60% in 2015, to 95% in 2019.</p>	<p>- The availability of a single window services for social protection programs to facilitate people to access a comprehensive social protection system, as well as to improve coordination and prevent overlaps among programs.</p>
	<p>a. Increased percentage of poor and vulnerable elderly people to receive basic necessity assistances, from 2.24% in 2015, to 2.28% in 2019; b. Increased percentage of poor and vulnerable disabled people to receive basic necessity assistances, from 14.48% in 2015, to 17.12% in 2019; c. Decreased number of poor households to receive conditional cash transfer, from three million households in 2015, to 2.8 million households in 2019.</p>	<p>- Increased amount of basic income security to correspond with the national benchmark of minimum basic cost of living, in order to prevent vulnerable people, including women, children, indigenous people and people with disability, from extreme deprivation of their basic needs; - The availability of a more applicable conditions for conditional cash transfers for women living in remote areas without access to health facilities.</p>
	<p>a. Increased enrollment number of the National Social Security System (SJSN) for Employment, from 29.5 million of formal employees and 1.3 million of informal employees in 2015, to 62.4 million and 3.5 million in 2019.</p>	<p>- The availability of regulations and/or other policies on unemployment benefit to prevent unemployed persons from extreme deprivation of their basic needs.</p>

*Analytical Framework for
Linking Sustainable Development Goals with Human Rights Obligations in Indonesia*

National Target	National Indicators	Suggested HRBA Indicators
1.4. Access to basic services.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. Increased coverage of maternal delivery care in health facilities, from 75% in 2015, to 85% in 2019; b. Increased coverage of basic immunization for children between the age of 12-23 months to 63% in 2019; c. Increased coverage of contraception use for women between the age of 15-49 years, from 61.9% in 2015, to 66% in 2019; d. Increased access to safe drinking water, from 60.9% in 2015, to 100% in 2019; e. Increased access to an adequate sanitation, from 60.9% in 2015, to 100% in 2019; f. Increased number of low-income households to access adequate housing to 18.6 households in 2019. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - The availability of reformed land ownership regulations and/or policies to simplify the registration process, reduce the costs, increase efficiency and diminish delays both for individual and collective registration process; - Increased percentage of joint land ownership of husband and wife; - Proportion of indigenous groups with secured land tenures; - Proportion of households without access to adequate housing.

The Roles of the UN Country System.

The UN Country system in Indonesia is committed to play a strong role to assist the Gol to achieve SDGs with three main modalities namely policy advocacy and advisory, capacity building and knowledge sharing. With regard to poverty reduction, the UNDP, for instance, is part of the UN system in Indonesia that has been a long-term partner of the Gol to address poverty issues, the Gol will benefit a lot from various assistances provide by UNDP to strengthen the capacity to implement the national poverty reduction strategies. Moreover, with regard to targets on social protection, the Gol will also benefit from close partnership with ILO to strengthen the national social protection floor system.